

Scientometrics in an Era of Large Language Models

Scott W. Cunningham

www.strath.ac.uk/humanities

INTRODUCTION

- I'd like to talk about the emergence of large-language models including ChatGPT.
- I would like to convince you of their importance and impact by examining their current applications.
- Then I'd like to describe how and why I think the field of scientometrics will need to adapt to this new technology.



- Brief demonstration
- Communicate an arc of progress
- Conclude with recommendations or opportunities

The Past



Jean-Paul Benzécri (1932 – 2019)

- Developed and popularised correspondence analysis
- Necessary technique for nominal data
- Displays and embeds of rows and columns
- Linguists found this technique invaluable for examining word usage patterns
- Precursor for science maps
- Parallel and later integrated with other techniques (PCA, SVD)

The Al Winter

- Noam Chomsky
- Influential linguist and cognitive scientist
- Argues for a "deep structure" to language
- Transformational rules

- Cognitive scientists attempted the same when encoding knowledge
- Automated translation promised
- Major funders became disenchanted

Information Retrieval

- Gerard Salton and Michael J. McGill
- Introduction to Modern Information Retrieval (1982)
- Pioneered the vector space model
- Queries and documents

- Scott Deerwester, et al.
- Bell Labs
- Latent Semantic Indexing
- Applies data reduction to vector spaces
- Eliminates noise, finds related words
- Early form of embedding

Deerwester, et al. (1983), p. 8

Unlike many typical uses of factor analysis, we are not necessarily interested in reducing the representation to a very low dimensionality, say two or three factors, because we are not interested in being able to visualize the space or understand it. But we do wish both to achieve sufficient power and to minimize the degree to which the space is distorted. We believe that the representation of conceptual space for any large document collection will require more than a handful of underlying independent "concepts", and thus that the number of orthogonal factors that will be needed is likely to be fairly large. Moreover, we believe that the model of a Euclidean space is at best a useful approximation. In reality, conceptual relations among terms and documents certainly involves more complex structures, including, for example, local hierarchies and non-linear interactions between meanings. More complex relations can often be made to approximately fit a dimensional representation by increasing the number of dimensions. In effect, different parts of the space will be used for different parts of the language or object domain. Thus we have reason to avoid both very low and extremely high numbers of dimensions. In between we are guided only by what appears to work best. What we mean by "works best" is not (as is customary in some other fields) what reproduces the greatest amount of variance in the original matrix, but what will give the best retrieval effectiveness

Scientometrics



- Eugene Garfield (1925 2017)
- Comprehensive citation index
- Co-citation analysis
- Bibliometric coupling
- Main path analysis

Newer Methods

Topic models

- Including latent Dirichlet analysis (LDA) and non-negative matrix factorisation (NMF)
- Probabilistic or distributional assumptions on the data
- Unsequenced "bag of words"

Embedding models

- Word2Vec
- Stochastic Network Embedding (TSNE) (Van der Maaten and Hinton, 2012)

Problems and issues

- Lack of a standard vocabulary
- Lack of a reference implementation
- Necessary computation
- Incompressible language
- Non-linearity
- Visualising high dimensional spaces

THE PRESENT

Large Language Model Questions

- What are they?
- How are they made?
- How are they used?
- How do they work?
- How can we best understand them?
- What do they do?

What are they?

- Large Language Models are neural networks
- Large quantities of data, deep structure, and clever input make them effective
- I'll briefly describe their architecture and transformation steps

New Advances

- The unreasonable effectiveness of data (Halevy et al. 2009)
- Deep learning (Hinton et al. 1986; Hinton et al. 2006)
- Recursion (c.f. Elman 1990)
- Attention is all you need (Vaswani et al. 2017)





Decoding GPT

Generative Pretrained Transformer

How are they made?

Somewhere in these architectural choices performance improvements are made

- Tokenisation and embedding
- Positions and sequences
- Normalisation and activation
- Parameters and layers
- Data and training

How are they used?

















How can we best understand them?



"A blurry JPEG of all the text on the Web."

"Think of ChatGPT as a blurry JPEG of all the text on the Web. It retains much of the information on the Web, in the same way that a JPEG retains much of the information of a higher-resolution image, but, if you're looking for an exact sequence of bits, you won't find it' all you will ever get is an approximation." "Indeed, a useful criterion for gauging a large language model's quality might be the willingness of a company to use the text that it generates as training material for a new model."

"Sometimes it's only in the process of writing that you discover your original ideas. . . Your first draft isn't an unoriginal idea expressed clearly; it's an original idea expressed poorly."

Chiang (2023)

"Behold the shoggoth"



Henry Farrell @henryfarrell · 4d ···· 1. economist.com/by-invitation/... So Cosma Shalizi and I have a piece in the Economist on shoggoths. The Large Language Models driving ChatGPT and Bing are indeed Lovecraftian monsters. But so too are markets, bureaucracies, and even democracy, if squinted at askance.



Henry Farrell @henryfarrell · 4d
2. The idea is straightforward. Like
@AlisonGopnik we don't see LLMs as analogous to individual human intelligences.
Instead, they're "cultural technologies" - systems for summarizing human created knowledge and making it useful. This puts the shoggoth meme in a different context



Henry Farrell @henryfarrell · 4d Replying to @henryfarrell

5. The point is that this is _nothing new._ Here, we're riffing on a fantastic piece that Cosma wrote a decade ago, arguing that markets and bureaucracies were vast, inhuman distributed systems of information-processing "the coldest of all cold monsters" bactra.org/weblog/699.html

. . .

🗘 3 🗘 8 🤎 68 📊 5,109 🛧



(Farrell and Shalizi, 2023)

"We want to believe"



(art by Alexis Poles, referenced by Baussells 2015)

How do they work?

Attention Heads



Layers



Parse Trees



Wolfram (2023)

Probing Classifiers

A Primer in BERTology (Rogers et al. 2020)

- Probing Classifiers (Belinkov 2021)
- Fill-in-the-gap Probes
- Analysis of Self-Attention Weights



What do they do?

- Collecting data
- Co-teaming with OpenAl
- Implementation
- Pre-processing
- Analysis
- Visualisation

Collecting Data

Search > Results for technological fo > Results	for technological forecasting and social change (Publication Titles)	PT	AU	BA	BE	GP	AF
284 results from Web of Science Co	re Collection for:		LA	DT	CT	CY	CL
			C3	RP	EM	RI	01
Q technological forecasting and social change	ge (Publication Titles)		C3 RP EM RI Z9 U1 U2 PU PD PY VL IS DI DL D2 EA HC HP DA UT J Soluk, J; Decker-Lat Soluk, J; Decker-Lat Soluk, Jonas; Decker Small steps for perspective on business r technologies in SMEs TEC CHANGE Eng Digital transf Non -disruptive digital t				PI
			PD	PI	VL DO	15	PN
Refined By: (Publication Years: 2023 X) Cl	lear all			UD DL		LA	PG
		л	Solu	лг 1 к Т.	DA	ui ar-Ian	
CD Copy query link		0	Soli	ik Jo	nag• I	Decker	.ye, c -Land
			DOI	Smal	ll ste	ns for	r the
Publications You may also like		per	specti	ve on	busin	ess ne	etwor
		tec	hnolog	ies in	n SMEs	TECI	HNOLO
Refine results	0/294 Add To Marked Liet Export w	CHA	NGE			Eng]	lish
				Digi	ital t	ransf	ormat
Search within results Q		Non	-disr	uptive	e digi	tal te	echno
	□ 1 Small steps for the big hit: A dynamic capabilities perspective on business netw						
	technologies in SMEs						
Filter by Marked List	Soluk, J; Decker-Lange, C and Hack, A	ta os	• • • • • •	7/501	0000	01	Cmol
Quick Filters	Jun 2023 TECHNOLOGICAL FORECASTING AND SOCIAL CHANGE 191	WUS	1.0009				SILLAT
Review Article 14	This study avalages have small and modium sized anterprises (SMSs) build an humanes networks to de	cap	abili	ties	pers	pecti	ve o
Open Access 86	the adoption of non-disruptive digital technologies (DT). Multiple mediation analysis is used to test th	dig	ital	techr	nolog:	ies i	n SM
E Associated Data	secondary data from 1470 British SMEs. The results reveal that SMEs rely on business networks to supp	med	lium-s	ized	ente:	rpris	es (
	Find it genution (C) Free Full Text From Publisher •••	dev	qoler	dvnam	nic ca	apabi	liti
		of	non-d	ligrur	tive	digi	tal
Citation Tonics Meso		01	lugia	i a r		to to	at t
	2 A socio-technical transition perspective on positive tipping points in climate ch	alla	TASTS	15 0	iseu	LO LE	SLL
6.3 Management 66	interacting feedback loops in offshore wind and electric vehicles acceleration	lno	lustry	seco	ondar	y dat	a ir
6.115 Sustainability Science 18	Geels, FW and Ayoub, M	rev	real t	hat S	SMEs :	rely	on b
6.185 communication 17	Aug 2023 May 2023 (Early Access) TECHNOLOGICAL FORECASTING AND SOCIAL CHANGE 193	dis	rupti	ve DT	ado	ption	. Th
6 294 Operations Research & Management 11	This paper opprace with climate mitigation debates on paritive tipping points, which attract instances	nar		offe	octe (of th	roo
	technological and social tipping point approaches. Building on recent attempts to overcome this dicht	par	arter				100
See all >	transitions perspective which shows how co -evolutionary interactions between techno-economic imp	pia	inning	, and	ı mar.	ketin	y ca

	LA	DT	CT	CY	CL	SP	HO	DE	ID	AB	C1
	C3	RP	EM	RI	OI	FU	FP	FX	CR	NR	TC
	Z9	U1	U2	PU	PI	PA	SN	EI	BN	J9	JI
	PD	PY	VL	IS	PN	SU	SI	MA	BP	ΕP	AR
	DI	DL	D2	EA	PG	WC	WE	SC	GA	PM	OA
	HC	HP	DA	UT							
J	Solu	ık, J;	Decke	er-Lan	ge, C;	Hack	, A				
Soluk, Jonas; Decker-Lange, Carolin; Hack, Andreas											
Small steps for the big hit: A dynamic capabilities											
perspective on business networks and non-disruptive digital											
technologies in SMEs TECHNOLOGICAL FORECASTING AND SOCIAL											
CHAN	IGE			Engl	ish	Arti	cle				
Digital transformation; Digital technology adoption;											
Non -disruptive digital technologies; Digital innovation;											

BF

CA

ΨТ

SO

SE

BS

WOS:000974581800001 Small steps for the big hit: A dynam capabilities perspective on business networks and non-disdigital technologies in SMEs This study explores how small medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) build on business networks develop dynamic capabilities that ultimately foster the a of non-disruptive digital technologies (DT). Multiple medianalysis is used to test this relationship, drawing on cre industry secondary data from 1470 British SMEs. The resulreveal that SMEs rely on business networks to support nondisruptive DT adoption. This relationship is mediated by parallel effects of three dynamic capabilities (HR, strate planning, and marketing capabilities). However, the resul-

Co-Teaming with OpenAl



Implementation

🗖 🔵 Home Pa 🗙 🥔 Data Han 🗙 🥭 BiblioBER 🗙 🕂 👘 🦳	×	🗖 💭 Home Par 🗙 🧧 Data Han 🗙 🧧 BiblioBER 🗙 🕂 👘 🗖	\times
C බ i localhost:8888/notebooks/ A ද ☆ 🙎	 b	C බ 🛈 localhost:8888/notebooks/ A ද 🕁 😩 … 👔 🚺	b
File Edit View Insert Cell Kernel Widgets Help Trusted Python 3 (ipykernel) O <	Q	File Edit View Insert Cell Kernel Widgets Help Trusted Python 3 (ipykernel) O Image: The state of the	Q
<pre>Image: Part of the Part o</pre>	 ▲ ↓ 	<pre>In [3]: # from transformers import BertTokenizer import torch In [3]: # from transformers import BertTokenizer import torch In [4]: # tokenizer = BertTokenizer.from_pretrained('bert-base-uncased') Downloading (]solvelmainvocabitd _ 222W7 [00.00<00.00.3.14MBig) C:\Users\seb1920e\Anaconda3\libsite-packages\huggingface_hub/file_download.py:133: UserNarning: 'huggingface_hub' cache-system uses symlinks by default to efficiently store duplicated files but your machine does not support them in C\Users\seb1920e\Anaconda3\libsite-packages\huggingface_hub/file_download.py:133: UserNarning: 'huggingface_hub' cache-system uses symlinks by default to efficiently store duplicated files but your machine does not support them in C\Users\seb1920e\LambdaLeyNULLeyNote or to run Python as an administrator. In order to see activate developer mode, see this article: https://docs.microsoft. com/en-us/induos/apps/gete.cid/acs/huggingface_hub/now-to-cachelinfittions. To support symlinks on Windows, you either need to activate Developer Mode or to run Python as an administrator. In order to see activate developer mode, see this article: https://docs.microsoft. com/en-us/induos/apps/gete.started/enable-your-device-for-development warnings.warn(message) Downloading ()wemainkoonfgison: 100%</pre>	 ▲ +
0 PT 1 AU 2 BA 3 BE 		In [9]: W max_length = 128 padding_length = max_length - len(input_ids)	

Preprocessing

text = "Your input text goes here."
tokens = tokenizer.tokenize(text)

input_ids = tokenizer.convert_tokens_to_ids(tokens)

input_ids = [tokenizer.cls_token_id] + input_ids + [tokenizer.sep_token_id]

attention_masks = [1] * len(input_ids)

▶ max_length = 128

```
padding_length = max_length - len(input_ids)
```

```
if padding_length > 0:
```

```
input_ids = input_ids + ([tokenizer.pad_token_id] * padding_length)
attention_masks = attention_masks + ([0] * padding_length)
```

else:

input_ids = input_ids[:max_length]
attention_masks = attention_masks[:max_length]

input_ids = torch.tensor(input_ids)
attention_masks = torch.tensor(attention_masks)

print(input_ids)

tensor([[101,	3617,	2740,	7248,	2005,	1996,	9750,	1029,	3145,	9886,
	1998,	8192,	13500,	1998,	3971,	2000,	4769,	2068,	3617,	9871,
	7248,	1006,	28144,	4523,	1007,	5050,	1037,	4659,	2047,	9575,
	2008,	2071,	3073,	1037,	7070,	13711,	2000,	3558,	3078,	2729,
	1011,	2005,	2742,	1010,	2011,	8161,	5366,	1010,	9229,	3229,
	2000,	9871,	1010,	1998,	4352,	5776,	8822,	1012,	2174,	1010,
	2107,	7248,	2024,	3701,	2109,	2651,	2011,	1996,	3920,	8213,
	1010,	2029,	9005,	1037,	1000,	3617,	11443,	1000,	2090,	1996,
	3920,	1998,	1996,	9750,	1012,	2023,	3720,	8704,	2000,	6709,
	1024,	1045,	1007,	1996,	8690,	3145,	13500,	2008,	26402,	9886,
	1998,	8192,	1997,	28144,	4523,	2011,	1996,	9750,	1010,	1998,
	2462,	1007,	2054,	28144,	2361,	11670,	2064,	2079,	2000,	10956,
	3445,	9886,	1998,	8192,	2011,	1996,	9750,	1012,	1996,	3720,
	9891,	2006,	24209,	11475,	27453,	7636,	2007,	9750 ,	1998,	21053,
	2832,	2951,	2013,	1037,	2350,	4467,	28144,	2361,	1012,	2057,
	2424,	2008,	1996,	9750,	23084,	2015,	2048,	3145,	13500,	2000,
	3988,	9886,	1997,	28144,	4523,	1024,	1045,	1007,	4997,	13818,
	1998,	2974,	10089,	1998,	2462,	1007,	2028,	3145,	8803,	12473,
	2119,	9886,	1998,	8192,	1011,	3768,	1997,	3404,	1012,	1996,
	4106,	2036,	14847,	3674,	2458,	15690,	2005,	28144,	2361,	7620,
	2000,	2488,	8752,	1996,	3791,	1997,	1996,	9750,	1010,	2164,
1	L5690,	2005,	4646,	2458,	1998,	21727,	2495,	3450,	1012,	2057,
	3073,	2019,	6377 ,	7705,	2041,	16992,	1996,	3145,	13500,	8690,
	1998,	3971,	2000,	4769,	2068,	1012,	1999,	2061,	2725,	1010,
	2057,	9002,	2000,	1996,	3906,	2006,	1049,	20192,	24658,	1998,
	2000,	1996,	3906,	2006,	7248,	1999,	9871,	1012,	102,	0,
	0,	0,	0,	0,	0,	0,	0,	0,	0,	0,
	0,	0,	0,	0,	0,	0,	0,	0,	0,	0,
	^	^	^	^	^	^	^	^	^	^

Analysis

from transformers import BertTokenizer, BertModel
import torch

model_name = 'bert-base-uncased'
tokenizer = BertTokenizer.from_pretrained(model_name)
model = BertModel.from_pretrained(model_name)

Downloading model.safetensors: 100%

with torch.no_grad():
 outputs = model(input_ids)
 embeddings = outputs.last_hidden_state

▶ print(embeddings) tensor([[[-0.9762, -0.0995, -0.8006, ..., 0.0029, 1.0137, -0.4809], [-0.7192, 1.2761, -0.5353, ..., 0.2435, 0.5061, 1.1344], [0.0832, 0.5186, -0.7893, ..., -0.3839, 0.0572, 0.4023], · · · , [0.5694, -0.1146, 0.4969, ..., -0.8004, -0.2793, -1.2694], [0.4882, -0.2114, 0.4366, ..., -0.7421, -0.2004, -1.2331], [0.4308, -0.0469, 0.3925, ..., -0.7531, -0.2243, -1.2997]]]) # there are 250 tokens, each in a dimension of 768 embeddings.shape B]: torch.Size([1, 250, 768]) ▶ import numpy as np X = embeddings[0].numpy() print(X.shape) (250, 768) np.sum(X,axis=0).shape 7]: (768,)

Visualisation

Perform t-SNE embedding
tsne = TSNE(n_components=2, random_state=42,init='pca')
embedded_data = tsne.fit_transform(data)

x = embedded_data[:,0]
y = embedded_data[:,1]

embedded_data.shape

(283, 2)

import matplotlib.pyplot as plt
plt.axis ([-2000, 2000, -600, 600])
plt.scatter(x,y)

<matplotlib.collections.PathCollection at 0x1dca717a9a0>



The Future

Challenges for Scientometrics

- Scientific language is not just natural language
- We need to represent more than words (authors, institutions, references, citations, patents)
- Attention windows are too short (about 400 words)
- Scientific knowledge is embodied in communities, over time
- We need to do more than chat with LLM outputs
- Most of us can't afford the compute to calculate our own models
- Correctness
- Reasoning

Opportunities

- There is an active community experimenting with what works
- The parameters of these models have leaked and are readily available
- Fundamental and hybrid algorithms
- Models of scientific text (SciBERT, SciSciNet) (Beltagy, et al. 2019; Lin et al. 2023)
- The model has language capabilities, and it transports
- Probing the networks for science (Rogers et al. 2020)
- Distilling the networks (Hinton et al. 2014)

Uptake

- Quite limited
- Most of the work applies bibiometrics to machine learning
- But see Sachini et. al (2022) in a recent publication in *Quantitative Science Studies* using BERT for classification



Continuing Need

- We still need scientometrics
- "Science of scientific knowledge"
- Applied purposes as well
 - Communicating
 - Tracking new knowledge
 - Technological problem solving (Swanson 1986; Smalheiser and Swanson, 1998)
 - Building research ecologies and districts

Recommendations

- We need to move to open-source computing languages including Python and R.
- The scientometric community needs to take advantage of the large computational investments going on in LLM, including BERT.
- We should take serious notice of the architectures behind these models.
- The availability of these models should stimulate new sorts of scientometric questions, and new applications for the policy and management communities.

CONCLUSIONS

- I've presented a reflexive account of LLM
- I hope to have contributed by making LLM an object of study, and also by advocating the use LLM to facilitate our own studies
- I think that LLM have solved the long-standing problem of effective representations of text
- You've permitted me an opportunity to experiment with ChatGPT in the making of this presentation

Appendix: Extra Slides

Tokenisation and Embedding

Tokenisation

- Stop words and stemming
- Byte Pair Encoding
- SentencePiece library

Embedding

- Embedding of words in highdimensional spaces
- Spaces encode meaning
- Word2Vec was one of the leading

Position and Sequence

- Position
 - The order of the word in the sentence is important to meaning
 - Grammar and syntax; other poorly understood reasons
 - We need to encode this

- Sequence
 - Addressing by repeated parsing or scanning
 - Recurrent Neural Networks
 - Learn the words which matter
 - Attention

Normalisation and Activation

Normalisation

• The layers are constantly being rescaled back to a unit length

Activation

- The layers use a non-linear transformation
- This enables a more expressive representation
- Rectified Linear Unit (ReLU)
- Returns non-negative values

Parameters and Layers

- A small ChatGPT model contains 12,873,072 parameters
- Attention heads [A] 4
- Embedding size [E] 256
- Layers [L] 4
- Sequence Length [S] 512
- Vocabulary [V] 30,000

Token embedding layers

$[V \times E]$

- Position embedding layer [S x E]
- Transformer blocks [A x L x E x E]

Data and Training

Data

- Web pages
- Books
- Scientific publications
- Social media
- Open-domain question-answering data sets
- Educational resources
- User-provided data
- One trillion words

Training

- Models are batch trained and so are static
- They are periodically retrained
- Applications fine tune the end results of the model
- Researchers estimate that training GPT-3 cost OpenAl around \$5 million
- Objective functions (predicting missing words, predicting sentences)

Realistic

- Question-answering systems: These models can be deployed in systems that provide answer to relevant questions based on context and available information.
- It can assist in these tasks by offering guidance, answering questions about proper procedures, providing safety instructions, troubleshoot, and assisting with training manuals.



Investigative

- Code generation: Some ChatGPT models are tailored to understand programming syntax and can be used to generate or suggest code snippets.
- Sentiment analysis: ChatGPT models can interpret and analyze various sentiments and emotions within texts, providing valuable insights for businesses and researchers.





Artistic

- Gaming and storytelling: ChatGPT models enhance the depth and variety of in-game characters, allowing them to engage in more natural and responsive conversations.
- Content generation: These models help create articles, blog posts, social media content, and more by generating relevant and coherent text.
- Creative writing: ChatGPT models can assist aspiring writers by suggesting ideas, generating plotlines, or even creating dialogues between characters.



Social

- Customer service: ChatGPT models are used to create chatbots for handling customer queries, improving response time and efficiency, and reducing the workload on human agents.
- Education and tutoring: These models can assist in education systems by generating learning material, answering questions, and offering personalized instruction.



Enterprising

• Business Development: ChatGPT can help develop business plans, marketing strategies, and sales pitches. It can provide general knowledge about regulations, financial matters, or industry trends, though it doesn't replace the expertise of trained professionals in financial or legal fields.



Conventional

- Language translation: These models assist in language translation tasks by understanding the context and generating accurate translations.
- Virtual assistants: ChatGPT models can be integrated into personal virtual assistants to provide smart, context-aware information, reminders, and other assistance.

